The Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme and agricultural policies in Tanzania: A Tale of Three Policies

International Conference Political Economy of Agricultural Policy in Africa

18-20 March 2013, Pretoria, South Africa

Brian COOKSEY, PEAPA

ACT 1: IN WHICH CAADP MEETS THE AGRICULTURAL SECTOR DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME AND KILIMO KWANZA, EMBRACES THE FIRST AND DISMISSES THE SECOND AS A 'SLOGAN'

Policy	Driver	Time- frame	Coordinator	Cost \$ billion	Finance	Key linkages	Main focus
Agricultural Sector Development Programme (ASDP)	Ministry of Agriculture (MAFC)	Phase 1: 2006-13 Phase 2: planned	MAFC	1.9	GoT, donors	Five 'agricultural' ministries; Donor projects	Smallholder production; Irrigation
Kilimo Kwanza	Tanzania National Business Council	2009- (not time- bound)	PMO-RALG	Not costed	GoT, donors, private sector	Commercial farmers; SAGCOT	Commercial agriculture
Tanzania Agriculture & Food Security Investment Plan (TAFSIP)	CAADP/ MAFC	2012-17	MAFC	5.3	GoT, donors, private sector, philanthro- capitalists	ASDP	Smallholder production; Food security

Structure of TAFSIP Level in Planning Hierarchy Structure of the TAFSIP NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT **VISION 2020/25** VISIONS MKUKUTA II & MKUZA II GROWTH AND POVERTY **REDUCTION STRATEGIES** ASDS/KILIMO KWANZA/ATI AGRICULTURAL SECTOR STRATEGIES AND SLOGANS AGRICULTURAL SECTOR DEVELOPMENT ASP ASDP/LSDP **PROGRAMMES/PLAN** TAFSIP /FSDP AND PROPOSED NA&FSIP UNDER CAADP FRAMEWORK PROGRAMMES OTHER PRIVATE ALL SECTORAL AGRICULTURAL AND RURAL GOVERNMENT DEVELOPMENT DEVELOPMENT AND PROJECTS SECTOR LED INVESTMENTS INITIATIVES PROGRAMMES AND LED SECTOR UNDER ASDP PROJECTS (ACTUAL AND PROGRAMMES IN THE INCORPORATED AGRICULTURE IN ZANZIBAR PLANNED) AND PROJECTS SECTOR ASP

TAFSIP AT A GLANCE

PROGRAMME	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	YEAR 3	YEAR 4	YEAR 5	TOTAL	%
Production and Commercialisation	958	1,148	1,254	1,361	1,500	6,221	71
Irrigation development	187	214	236	265	298	1,200	14
Policy & Institutional Reforms and Support	104	170	131	145	131	681	8
Rural Infrastructure, Market Access & Trade	62	76	79	72	63	357	4
Food and Nutrition Security	23	49	49	44	46	211	2
Disaster Management and Climate Change Mitigation	9	11	19	16	12	66	<1
Private Sector Development	4	3	3	3	3	16	<1
Total	1,351	1,672	1,770	1,906	2,05	8,752	100
USD million equivalent	819	1,013	1,073	1,155	1,245	5,304	

ACT 2: IN WHICH US/G8 HIGHJACKS THE CAADP AGENDA IN THE INTERESTS OF GLOBAL AGRIBUSINESS

- In May 2012 US President Obama launched the New Alliance for Food Security and Nutrition (NAFSN).
- Endorsing TAFSIP, NAFSN proposes major new investment and regional trade agreements.
- Numerous US departments are involved in a co-ordinated policy initiative to promote global food and energy production and support US /G8 agribusiness.
- The aid community, philanthro-capitalists and venture capital funds have all aligned with the emerging strategy.
- CAADP/TAFSIP IS NOW THE US/G8 VEHICLE FOR THE PROMOTION OF LARGE-SCALE AGRICULTURE IN TANZANIA (AND ELSEWHERE) EVEN THOUGH THE CONTENT OF THE US/G8 POLICY BEARS ALMOST NO RESEMBLANCE TO THE ORIGINAL TAFSIP BLUEPRINT.

The New Alliance for Food Security and Nutrition (NAFSN)

- Under NAFSN G8 members pledged USD 900 million to support CAADP
- Private companies announced ambitious investment intentions
- The Tanzanian Government committed to policy reforms, including land rights for investors and reduced trade barriers

G8 Commitments to NAFSN

Country	Commitments (USD million)	Period (years)	Sectors
USA	315	5	Agriculture
France	50	4	Agriculture, food security, rural development, nutrition
Germany	95	2	Rural energy & water infrastructure, biodiversity conservation
Japan	178	3	Agriculture and agriculture-related areas
Russia	30	1	No details
UK	99	3	Agriculture, food security, and nutrition
E Union	130	2	Ongoing and planned programmes
Total	897		

NAFSN PRIVATE INVESTMENT 'PLEDGES' to AFRICA

- Monsanto and Syngenta (seeds, pesticides)
- Unilever (consumer goods)
- Diageo, SABMiller and Armajaro Trading (drinks)
- AGCO (farm machinery)
- Swiss Re (insurance)
- United Phosphorous and YARA International (fertilisers)
- Vodafone

AGRICULTURAL POLICY STAKEHOLDERS IN TANZANIA

- Ruling elite: patronage and vote-seeking incentives
- Investment in and profits from large land holdings
- Endorsement of Kilimo Kwanza (not ASDP/TAFSIP)
- Yet ambiguity in public support for 'the private sector'
- Agricultural produce processing and trading cartels versus emerging (?) African commercial farmers (and MNCs)
- Continued disempowerment of smallholder farmers
- Civil society voices against GMO/agribusiness, 'land grabbing'
- Donors: falling in line with their agribusinesses → reducing investment risks. Funding private *not* public investments

CAADP'S IMPACT

- CAADP/TAFSIP has mobilised modest additional investments via the Global Agriculture and Food Security Program (GAFSP) BUT:
- Has had minimal/no impact on agricultural spending
- Has stretched policy-making and coordination capacities
- Though formally participatory, CAADP/TAFSIP involvement of civil society and the private sector has been token.

CONCLUSIONS

- Tanzania's recent economic growth has largely bypassed small farmers: traditional policies failed to increase productivity /reduce poverty
- CAAPD initially produced an enhanced ASDP (state-led model of agricultural development) focusing on service provision in which the private sector played a residual and dependent role
- Kilimo Kwanza heralds the emergence of Tanzanian commercial farmers as an active policy lobby
- NAFSN abandons the 'enhanced ASDP' version of CAADP and replaces it with an enhanced 'Kilimo Kwanza' version favouring MNCs.